

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5000

**APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Retreat & Regular Meeting  
9:00 a.m., Wednesday, January 11, 2012

**CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Chairperson Hayes called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Stan Hayes, Vice Chairperson Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Secretary Sam Altshuler, P.E., and Council Members Ken Blonski, M.S., Benjamin Bolles, Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Liza Lutzker, Jane Martin, Dr. P.H., Estes Al Phillips, Jessica Range, Jonathan Ruel, Dorothy Vura-Weis, M.D., M.P.H., and Murray Wood.

Arrived Late: Council Members Jennifer Bard and Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D.

Absent: Council Members Jeffrey Bramlett and Gary Lucks, J.D.

Also Present: Director Brad Wagenknecht.

**INTRODUCTION OF NEW ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS:**

Chairperson Hayes welcomed Sean Gallagher, new Clerk of the Boards, and Council Members Estes Al Phillips (*Organized Labor*), Jessica Range (*Community Planning*) and Murray S. Wood (*Public Health Agency*). The new Council Members introduced themselves at Chairperson Hayes' invitation.

**OATH OF OFFICE:**

The Clerk of the Boards administered the oath of office for Mr. Phillips, Ms. Range and Mr. Wood.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:**

Chairperson Hayes called for public comment.

Susan Goldsborough, Executive Director, Families for Clean Air, commended the Council for their outreach programs in the past and requested an ultrafine particulate matter study of wood smoke and a complete wood smoke exposure assessment.

## **CONSENT CALENDAR:**

### **1. Approval of Minutes of November 9, 2011, Advisory Council Meeting**

Member Altshuler requested an amendment to the roll call portion of the minutes to reflect his appropriate professional suffix, "P.E." instead of "Ph.D."

Member Bornstein made a motion to approve the minutes of November 9, 2011, as amended. Member Brazil seconded the motion; carried unanimously without objection.

## **RECOGNITION:**

### **2. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Members**

The Council recognized outgoing Member Peter Chamberlin and presented a token of appreciation for his service. Peter Chamberlin addressed the Council.

The Council recognized outgoing Member Alexandra Desautels and presented to Dr. Martin, on her behalf, a token of appreciation for her service. Chairperson Hayes read a prepared statement on behalf of Ms. Desautels.

The Council recognized outgoing Member Kendall Oku in absentia.

### **3. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Chairperson**

The Council recognized outgoing Chairperson Ken Blonski for his dedicated leadership and service to air quality in the Bay Area and presented a token of appreciation for his service.

## **AIR DISTRICT OVERVIEW**

### **4. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO**

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, provided an update on pending and planned Air District activities, policies and initiatives, including the status of the Spare the Air Program, the budgetary constraints of the District, an update on the computer Production System project, the upcoming relocation of the District's headquarters, and District policy initiatives regarding ozone, particulate matter, metal melting operations, vacuum trucks, cement facilities and the regional smog program, and the Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) Program.

**Council comments:** Member Bard discussed with Mr. Broadbent and Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, the District's plans for the CARE Program and Member Bard's proposals to redefine which communities might be included and how to further expand and improve the program, the current measurements of particulate matter levels, and the viability of issuing permits to regulate the use of wood smoke instead of outright banning it. Member Vura-Weis, Mr. Stevenson and Mr. Broadbent discussed the gains resulting for the Council's work on fine particulate matter to date.

Member Bornstein and Mr. Stevenson discussed the methods by which the District determines when to impose a Spare the Air Day and Member Bornstein suggested the District consider running more precise numerical models than the statistical models used for meteorological studies.

Member Martin and Mr. Broadbent discussed the land use planning challenges being confronted in West Oakland.

Member Lutzker suggested that the wood smoke issue is best characterized as not only an environmental concern but a personal health matter.

Member Holtzclaw and Mr. Broadbent discussed the possibility of working with the City and County of San Francisco on a municipal ban on wood smoke as a method by which to garner public attention in a different light, considering the reputation of San Francisco as a national frontrunner in the realm of municipal management.

## **RETREAT**

### **5. Discussion of the 2012 Advisory Council meetings, including format, topics and dates**

Mr. Stevenson presented the 2012 Advisory Council Meetings: Format, Topics and Date, including a brief overview of the dates, topics and format of the Council's 2011 Agenda and proposals regarding the same for 2012.

Chairperson Hayes thanked Mr. Stevenson for the presentation and opened the topic for Council comments.

**Council comments:** Member Bornstein suggested that presenters be warned in advance to lessen the density of the material and to make cautious and considered use of acronyms, commended the reports and presentations of staff and the pacing and structure of last year's agenda, and urged staff to consider the implementation of modeling. Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules & Research, addressed the Council regarding the implementation of modeling as a topic to be addressed by Saffet Tanrikulu, Modeling Tools & Resources Manager, under another agenda item later in the meeting. Member Altshuler commended the accelerated member comment period implemented in 2011, suggested a change in the content and timeline for the handling of Council minutes, and recommended that the District consider the Bay Area's unique characteristics when considering solutions to its air management issues. Member Bard expressed her appreciation for receiving both the minutes and summaries of the meetings, stated a preference that the Members have an opportunity to make recommendations on the focus of the year's work rather than having it dictated to them, and requested that a speaker on the urgent subject of wood smoke be lined up so that action may be taken in a timely manner. Member Holtzclaw suggested the return of speaker Dr. Rajiv Bhatia, who presented two or three years prior, and that the District look to a wider circle of innovators in the area of air management, such as individuals from Germany. Member Blonski suggested that no more than two speakers be scheduled for each meeting of the Council and that the Council's report to the Board of Directors be prioritized differently on the agenda so as to maximize the number of Directors present. Member Cherry suggested, relative to Meeting 3 – Reducing exposure to UFP in September 2012, including a presenter that can speak to mitigation strategies and new advances.

Member Lutzker echoed Member Cherry's comment and suggested a focus on mitigation strategy. Member Bolles commended the Council on its recent presentation to the Board of Directors. Member Phillips requested copies of the relevant material on the year's work by the Advisory Council, suggested that the District focus on striking a balance between managing air quality and its image with the public, the latter of which often seems to take lower priority, and requested clarification of slide 4, Health Benefits of a 1% Reduction of Air Pollutants. Mr. Stevenson responded as to the slide and offered Member Phillips a copy of the current Clean Air Plan to further clarify. Member Bedsworth suggested that presentations towards year end be focused on how best to incorporate the knowledge developed over the course of the year into informing District decisions. Member Ruel suggested that staff endeavor to put a finer point on what Council recommendations might be most beneficial by providing advance briefings on the connection between current District projects and speakers' topics. Member Altshuler expressed his gratitude for the opportunity to serve on the Council and suggested that, should the wood smoke matter be taken up, the Council focus on fireplaces, as they are the gross polluters within that category, rather than examining the category as a whole. Member Range requested copies of the material from the Advisory Council's work last year, particularly the September workshops regarding mitigation strategies and information relative to the retrofitting of existing buildings, as found on the September, 2011 Agenda. Member Bornstein suggested a change in the minutes, with a paragraph summary of the presentation and a full detail of any dialogue not contained in the presentations; that time be reserved at the last meeting of each year for members to share with staff their suggestions on topics for the coming year; that the District make outreach efforts to universities and the like in order to develop a more robust audience for the Council and, in turn, a more active community of speakers and audience members; echoed Member Blonski's suggestion that the Council's report to the Board of Directors be prioritized differently on the agenda so as to maximize the number of Directors present and Member Ruel's suggestion that District staff endeavor to provide the Council with advance briefings regarding District work that may be relevant to presentations; and expressed his skepticism about the accuracy of slide 4, Health Benefits of a 1% Reduction of Air Pollutants, namely the percentage allotted to toxics. Member Vura-Weis suggested that presentations and audio recordings be posted as supplemental material, along with agendas and minutes, with their content excluded from the minutes themselves. Chairperson Hayes made closing comments and requested that Meeting 3 – Reducing exposure to UFP, include material regarding pollution levels in proximity to roadways and echoed other Member comments that material covered in presentations not be included within the minutes, but that the minutes should instead focus on the panel discussion.

## **6. Review and Discussion of 2011**

Gary Kendall, Advisory Council Liaison, welcomed the new members of the Council and concurred that shorter, more succinct minutes, which rely on the presentations to speak for themselves, will likely move through the drafting phase more quickly and that these changes represent movement in the right direction. Mr. Kendall went on to present Review and Discussion of 2011, including potential changes for 2012, and discussed the same with the Council.

**Council comments:** Member Blonski shared that the use of fire is an important tool for managing open space and the curious interplay between his profession and his work with the District. Member Bornstein noted that guest speakers frequently seem to face inadequate time to complete presentations and suggested that future presenters be told they have 45 minutes, which

will allow time for run over, Council questions and general discussion within the available hour. Member Ruel revisited the request that District staff endeavor to provide the Council with advance briefings regarding District work that may be relevant to speakers to clarify that the briefings can be informal and do not require a full presentation in order to be helpful to the Council. Member Bard suggested that speakers be encouraged to include clear and concise recommendations in conclusion and that the number of topics available for consideration be left open for discussion rather than set for the year. Mr. Kendall responded that the number is not set and described a possible additional speaker for this year that is not currently on the agenda. Member Bornstein urged staff to initiate dialogue with presenters in these meetings as it ultimately serves the Council for its members to witness these exchanges. Member Martin recommended that Council workgroups be composed in such a way as to fully utilize the skill sets of its members. Member Bedsworth and Mr. Kendall discussed the possibility of presentations being broadcast into Council meetings, via the internet, as a way of lessening the costs and inconvenience imposed upon speakers so, in turn, the Council potentially increases its access to a greater range of speakers and their subject matter expertise.

## **PRESENTATION**

### **7. District Ultrafine Particle Monitoring and Modeling**

Mr. Stevenson began the presentation of brief reports on Air District Ultrafine Particle Monitoring and Modeling, including overviews of instrumentation, potential monitoring locations for 2012 and in future years, and data analysis and modeling methods. Mr. Tanrikulu finished the same.

**Council comments:** Member Bedsworth requested clarification regarding near roadway monitoring requirements of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency. Member Altshuler suggested the I-580 as a potential monitoring location in light of the lack of diesel trucks because of the comparative value the data may provide. Member Altshuler and Mr. Tanrikulu discussed the value added by including the application of chemistry in the modeling and analysis. Member Kurucz suggested two monitors in close, but varying, proximity to a major roadway to collect data reflecting dissipation distances. Member Brazil echoed and reinforced, and discussed with Mr. Stevenson, the inquiry by Member Altshuler about monitoring in a diesel free environment and the value of the data that would result. Member Vura-Weis inquired whether there is an emissions inventory that is available in a form that is presentable to the Council and, after discussing with Mr. Tanrikulu how the raw data is being collected, requested that he provide a final analysis to each member of the Council when available. Member Martin and Mr. Tanrikulu discussed the availability of an analysis of the health consequences of this data, as has been prepared for other projects in the past, and the project production goals for this program. Member Bard, Mr. Tanrikulu and Mr. Stevenson discussed the scope of the emissions inventory, whether wood smoke is included specifically, and that initial data points to an absence of ultrafine particulate matter in wood smoke. Member Bornstein commended Mr. Tanrikulu's work in the field, both past and present. Chairperson Hayes shared his observation that the proper form of measurement for ultrafine particulate matter is still up for debate, cautioned about the spatial scaling effects on data analysis, mentioned the importance of localized near roadway modeling, suggested the varying forms that examinations of high exposure scenarios could take, and proposed that staff consider alternative modeling methods for examinations of the source of wood smoke concentration in the Marin area.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

- 8. Chairperson's Report:** Chairperson Hayes accepted volunteers for and appointed Members Altshuler, Bolles, Kurucz and Phillips to the working committee to compile the report for the upcoming meeting in February, with Member Kurucz to be the principal author.

**9. Council Member Comments/Other Business**

Chairperson Hayes and Members Bornstein and Kurucz thanked the District for their sponsorship of and participation in the Air and Waste Management Association conference and expressed their satisfaction with the conference.

**10. Time and Place of Next Meeting**

Wednesday, February 8, 2012, at 9:00 a.m., at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

- 11. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 12:06 p.m.

*/s/ Sean Gallagher*

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards