

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Wednesday, April 9, 2014

Note: An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Benjamin Bolles, Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., Heather Forshey, Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., Sara T. L. Mayer, M.P.P., Timothy O'Connor, Esq., and Estes Al Phillips.

Absent: Members Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Frank Imhof, Kraig Kurucz, Bruce Mast and Laura E. Tam.

Also Present: None.

Opening Comments:

Chairperson Altshuler gave opening comments regarding the meeting agenda and outstanding action items, including review of outstanding questions for past presenters, staff and the Advisory Council (Council); an update on planning for the 2014 Annual Air & Waste Management Association Conference; the delivery of an organization chart from staff; year-end event planning; and the future review of Council reports in 2009 and 2010.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD: There were no requests for public comment.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of the Minutes of the March 13, 2014 Council Meeting

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: There were no requests for public comment.

Council Action:

Member Marshall made a motion to approve the minutes of March 13, 2014; Member Alvarez seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Alvarez, Bramlett, Cherry, Forshey, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Lutzker, Marshall, Mayer and Phillips.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Brazil and Range.

ABSENT: Bolles, Bornstein, Imhof, Kurucz, Mast, O'Connor and Tam.

DISCUSSION

2. Discussion and Finalization of Draft Report on the Council's February 13, 2014 Meeting

Council Comments:

The Council and staff deliberated upon proposed revisions to the draft report on the Advisory Council meeting on February 23, 2014.

NOTED PRESENT: Member Bolles was noted present at 9:35 a.m.

Public Comments:

David McCoard, Sierra Club, addressed the Council in support of the preliminary draft recommendation #1.

Council Action:

The Council requested the matter be agendaized for further discussion in the future.

PRESENTATION

3. Air District Staff Present Information on Programs and Activities Involving Climate Protection

Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, introduced Brian Bateman, Health and Science Officer, who gave the staff presentation *Overview of Energy Issues*, including world energy consumption and related carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions by fuel type; worldwide delivered energy consumption by sector and fuel; growth in energy use in China and other developing countries; current U.S. energy consumption and projections by sector and fuel type; U.S. consumption, production and importation of petroleum and other liquid fuels; U.S. crude oil production; trends and projections in U.S. crude oil supplies and quality; crude oil issues; crude

slate and refinery CO₂ emissions; U.S. natural gas production; U.S. per capita energy use and energy-related CO₂ emissions; California energy consumption, sources and per capita use in 2011; California crude oil production; key California measures for reducing CO₂ emissions from energy use; Bay Area energy-related greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in 2011; Bay Area energy production and power plants; new Bay Area power plants; and summary.

NOTED PRESENT: Member O'Connor was noted present at 10:27 a.m.

The Council and staff discussed, at slide 26, *Bay Area Power Plants*, why geothermal was not included in the table.

Mr. Bateman concluded the presentation.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed whether back-up generators and rooftop photovoltaic were included in the percentages provided on slide 26, *Bay Area Power Plants*; refinery emissions and crude slates in terms of changes in sulfur content, District permitting considerations and possible public health and safety concerns; an explanation of the component parts of "Oil Refining 19%" on slide 24, *Bay Area Energy-Related GHG Emissions 2012 – CO₂e*; the makeup of synthetic crude oil; the composition of tar sands crude if and when it arrives in California for refining; clarification of the effect of changes in crude oil slate and sulfur content on slide 15, *Crude Slate and Refinery CO₂ Emissions*; the opportunity for local change with global impact in the realm of energy use as opposed to reduced emissions; whether future staff presentations will provide more information on Air District programs and activities involving climate protection; whether studies are available about the environmental and societal implications of emerging U.S. crude oil production methods; the backup generator report from staff, including numbers and uses, and the viability of alternative fuel sources; backup generator requirements dictated by law; whether and how CO₂ and GHG are considered, tracked and reported out by the Air District; and whether Pacific Gas & Electric is utilizing flow batteries in its backup energy storage program.

Public Comments: There were no requests for public comment.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

4. Council Member Comments/Other Business:

The Council discussed the related activities each member is involved in outside of their roles on the Council.

The Council and staff discussed the impressions of the report writing work group and staff regarding the report writing process and the identity of speakers expected to present in May.

5. Report of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO):

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy APCO, Brian Bunger, District Counsel, and Mr. Stevenson jointly presented an update on and discussed with the Council Senate Bill 1415 (Hill).

6. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Wednesday, May 14, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

7. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 12:10 p.m.

/s/ Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards