

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Wednesday, September 10, 2014

Note: Audio and video recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Frank Imhof, Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., Bruce Mast, Timothy O'Connor, Esq., and Laura E. Tam.

Absent: Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Benjamin Bolles, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Heather Forshey, Kraig Kurucz, SaraT L. Mayer, M.P.P., and Estes Al Phillips (resigned).

Also Present: None.

Opening Comments:

The Advisory Council (Council) discussed the composition of the work group that will prepare the draft Council report on the upcoming presentation and discussion.

PRESENTATION

1. California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals (Out of Order Agenda Item #2)

Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, introduced Professor Daniel M. Kammen, Ph.D., and provided a brief description of his background.

California's Energy Future

Professor Daniel M. Kammen, Ph.D.

Class of 1935 Distinguished Professor of Energy, University of California, Berkeley

Professor in the Energy and Resources Group, Energy and Resources Group

Professor of Public Policy, Goldman School of Public Policy

Founding Director, Renewable and Appropriate Energy Laboratory

NOTED PRESENT: Member Brazil was noted present at 9:10 a.m. and Member O'Connor was noted present at 9:11 a.m.

Prof. Kammen gave a presentation entitled *Energy and Climate Opportunities for the Bay Area* (a copy of which is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>).

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

2. California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 GHG Goals

Council Comments:

The Council, Prof. Kammen and staff discussed the source of funding for Prof. Kammen's research; how to implement the type of comprehensive planning necessary to address climate issues while respecting local control; the proper role and focus of community planning; a reconciliation of the conclusions drawn in presentations by Professor Mark Jacobson, Ph.D., for wind, water and solar only, and that of Jane C.S. Long, Ph.D., for all available options; whether Prof. Kammen's models include the costs of externalities such as water and public health; the source of the map data as consumption based, not monitoring of actual emissions; whether and how Prof. Kammen's team is working with Dr. Jim Williams, Energy + Environmental Economics, and the State on the SWITCH model; the Air District's role in larger-scale efforts; the cost-effectiveness and advisability of electrification retrofitting of existing buildings; the stability of the existing grid with the implementation of distributed generation and its two-way transmission capability; possible government policies that would support Prof. Kammen's models if implemented, such as Denmark's siting review practice; the importance of including all of the metrics of value to the Air District in its permit reviews and similar practices; the advisability of requiring carbon analysis by businesses who submit applications to the Air District for projects of a certain size; the idea that carbon accounting for all activities is of greater value than divestment, to eventually be followed by accountings of various natural resources as well as health-impact modeling; the importance of developing strategies that go beyond Assembly Bill 32 while also being pro-business; the need for policies that completely transform the prevailing view of social and environmental justice; the basis for the conclusion regarding \$40 per ton of carbon emissions, as shown in slide 6, *Energy System Modeling Efforts in the Renewable and Appropriate Energy Laboratory, UC Berkeley*; the fact that energy demand response was not included in the modeling because of a current lack of cost data; the need for net metering and two-way transmission; the need for integration of stationary and mobile energy demand; whether the models take into account increasing global temperatures; the viability of hydrogen as a green energy source and storage medium; and the advisability of the Air District developing a consumption-based carbon footprint data set.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEM 3) (Agenda Item #1)

3. Approval of the Minutes of the July 9, 2014 Council Meeting:

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action:

Member Holtzclaw made a motion, seconded by Member Marshall, to approve Consent Calendar Item 3; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Brazil, Cherry, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Imhof, Lutzker, Marshall, Mast, Range and Tam.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: O'Connor.

ABSENT: Alvarez, Bolles, Bornstein, Bramlett, Forshey, Mayer, Kurucz and Phillips.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD: No requests received.

OTHER BUSINESS

4. Council Member Comments/Other Business:

The Council and staff discussed the low ozone levels in the Bay Area during Labor Day weekend and the recent trend of weather patterns in the early and late summer that contribute to air quality exceedences; an update on the Kinder Morgan lawsuit involving the Air District; report writing logistics; the impact of the Napa earthquake; whether additional speakers and reports are anticipated this calendar year; plans for the Council's year-end presentation to the Board of Directors (Board); the unfortunate absence of input from local communities, particularly those deemed disadvantaged, in the material being used to generate the Council reports and year-end presentation to the Board; an update on Senate Bill (SB) 1415; and tentative plans for meetings, presentations and reports from January through June 2015.

5. Report of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer:

Mr. Stevenson, Brian Bunger, District Counsel, and the Council discussed the lack of information available regarding Governor Brown's stance on SB 1415.

6. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Wednesday, October 8, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

7. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 11:53 a.m.

151 Sean Gallagher
Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards